UNESCO

United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization

Organisation
des Nations Unies
pour l'éducation,
la science et la culture

Organización
de las Naciones Unidas
para la Educación,
la Ciencia y la Cultura

Организация
Объединенных Наций по
вопросам образования,
науки и культуры

منظمة الأمم المتحدة
للتربية والعلم والثقافة

联合国教育、
科学及文化组织

# An Evaluation
# of UNESCO Publications
# on Human Rights Education

Audrey Osler, Hugh Starkey and Kerry Vincent

*30 April 2002*

An Evaluation of UNESCO Publications on Human Rights Education

*Report to UNESCO Section of Education for Universal Values*

**30 April 2002**

**Audrey Osler, Hugh Starkey and Kerry Vincent**

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

1       This evaluation of UNESCO human rights education materials for use in the formal
        sector was carried out from December 2001 to April 2002 by the Centre for
        Citizenship Studies in Education at the University of Leicester, on behalf of the
        UNESCO Section of Education for Universal Values.

2       The evaluation is in response to General Conference resolution 30C/16 (1999) and to
        the request of the Executive Board (2001) that an overall strategy for human rights
        education be incorporated into the 2002-2003 Programme and Budget.

3       The items identified by the Education for Universal Values to be evaluated were
        published between 1997 and 2001 and include five volumes commissioned by
        UNESCO headquarters; material produced by ASPnet; an extensive citizenship
        education kit and four books on human rights and democracy produced in Southern
        Africa for use in the region.

4       The evaluation took into account UNESCO's overall strategy for human rights
        education, as defined by the 1974 *Recommendation concerning Education for
        International Understanding;* the 1995 *Declaration and Integrated Framework of
        Action on Education for Peace, Human Rights and Democracy;* other relevant
        UNESCO documents, including those of the General Conference and Executive
        Board; and the Plan of Action of the United Nations Decade for Human Rights
        Education (1995-2004).

5       The evaluation reviewed the publications against an analytical grid; reported on
        users' and officers' perceptions of their impact; and assessed the number of copies
        disseminated. The report includes a checklist for the evaluation of future HRE
        publications and recommendations for such publications.

6       The study was largely qualitative. The analysis of publications was complemented
        by interviews with 11 staff at UNESCO headquarters and an email survey of users.
        Responses were received from 10 countries in Africa, the Americas and Europe. No
        responses were received from the Asia Pacific region.

7       Strategic guidance on human rights education is provided in UNESCO's 1996-2001
        medium term strategy which states:

        Education is at the heart of any strategy for peace-building. It is through
        education that the broadest possible introduction can be provided to the values,
        skills and knowledge which form the basis of respect for human rights and
        democratic principles, the rejection of violence, and a spirit of tolerance,
        understanding and mutual appreciation among individuals, groups and nations.

8       The 1995 Integrated Framework suggests that UNESCO distribute its materials
        'especially in countries where the production of teaching materials is proving slow
        owing to economic difficulties'.

9       The report defines human rights education drawing on the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and stressing the need for education which is action-orientated and which enables the respect and defence of human rights.  The 1995 Declaration and Integrated Framework stresses that the goals of education include knowledge, values, attitudes and skills as well as an active commitment to human rights. Action to eliminate discrimination against girls and against those who are vulnerable to intolerance racism and xenophobia are emphasised.

10      Publications with a UNESCO imprint should:
- Cover particular concepts and issues (including peace, democracy, human rights, tolerance and sustainable development)
- Promote active teaching methods
- Promote the development of values, attitudes and skills and not just knowledge
- Promote the development of educational institutions as sites where human rights and democracy are practised
- Draw attention to significant UN documents and contain core text from these
- Support an interdisciplinary approach to the teaching of human rights
- Include activities that will enable a critical analysis of the media
- Encourage the development of innovative approaches and best practice
- Challenge discrimination and promote diversity
- Promote joint projects, either nationally or internationally or involve the exchange of experiences, ideas or research

11      Users were generally familiar with the 1995 Declaration and used it, alongside other UN documents to enable them to establish goals, priorities and guidelines for human rights education.

12      Respondents from all three regions reported using a range of resources. As expected, the use of those produced for the Southern Africa region was limited to that continent. The materials were used for curriculum design and policy development; the development of teaching and assessment materials; as training materials in universities and in initial and in-service teacher training; and to support specific human rights education projects.

13      Our analysis of materials suggests that they had relatively good coverage of a range of UNESCO themes including non-violent conflict resolution, tolerance, democracy, human rights, religious intolerance sustainable development and cultural diversity.

14      Other themes, such as anti-racism and terrorism are inadequately covered in the materials. Gender equality receives some coverage, but none of the publications evaluated gives it very full coverage.

15      Users generally perceived the resources to be 'very useful' and 'useful' in terms of coverage of UNESCO priorities and themes but more so in their coverage of 'human rights' and 'tolerance'. The coverage of  'non-violence" and 'democracy' was judged to be relatively sound, but the resources were not rated highly in terms of their coverage of racism.

16      All respondents thought that UNESCO should continue to commission and publish materials on human rights education, noting that there is a need for good classroom materials on human rights education and few materials available to teachers in comparison with conventional subjects.

17      Several respondents thought that materials from UNESCO should be more widely disseminated. Barriers to effective dissemination identified by users were the limited funds available in some countries and regions and need for more materials to be made available in national languages.

18      Staffing at UNESCO Headquarters provides very limited capacity to actively disseminate HRE materials. There is no mechanism to follow up the use of the materials once they have been produced or to receive systematic feed-back on their impact.

19      Officers were usually well aware of the strategic guidance provided by the General Conference and the Medium Term Strategy.  However, evidence from staff suggested that they would benefit from clear guidance and support in operationalising the strategy.

## 20.      Conclusions and recommendations

20.1   The sample of UNESCO HRE publications analysed is generally of a high quality and fit for purpose.

20.2   The publications contribute to UNESCO's mission and Medium Term Strategy in the following ways:
*       dissemination of normative values
*       provision of an authoritative model, adaptable for local use
*       coverage of a wide range of UNESCO themes

20.3   There are every few materials which may be considered to address the key themes of terrorism and anti-racism.  Even when such themes are covered, users judge this coverage to be less useful than in other areas.

20.4   The degree to which the various resources had been effectively disseminated varied considerably.

20.5   There needs to be greater co-ordination within UNESCO between those responsible for commissioning publications and those responsible for publication processes, in order for dissemination strategies to be more fully developed and implemented.

20.6   Dissemination must be an integral part of the process of materials development not an afterthought.  The *Peace Package* (developed by ASPnet schools) and disseminated through ASPnet is exemplary in this respect.

20.7 Further attention needs to be given to translation strategies, including the funding of translation for countries experiencing economic difficulties.

20.8 UNESCO lacks information about the dissemination of co-published resources and their impact.

20.9 Criteria for co-publication and for badging of materials need to be explicit and transparent, so that both users and officers can be assured that the materials reflect UNESCO's mission.

20.10 Co-published regionally produced materials appear well-suited to their audiences and highly valued by those users who responded to our enquiries.

20.11 The data collected from officers suggests that there is a lack of an overall strategy for the production of HRE materials.

**Recommendations for future HRE publications**

i.      UNESCO continues to commission, publish and disseminate HRE materials.

ii.     UNESCO develops a strategy for the publication and dissemination of HRE materials, taking into consideration the needs for a wide range of countries to have access to materials based on normative standards.

iii.    UNESCO gives particular consideration, within this publication strategy to regions and countries where there is a shortage of educational resources.

iv.     UNESCO ensures that those commissioning and producing HRE materials give emphasis to areas currently neglected, namely issues of anti-racism, gender and terrorism.

v.      UNESCO ensures that dissemination is an integral part of any publication project.

vi.     UNESCO works more closely with users from a full range of regions and countries to monitor and evaluate use of materials (e.g. use focus groups in production and dissemination)

vii.    UNESCO builds in systematic review and external evaluation of its future HRE publication projects.

viii.   UNESCO reviews its funding mechanisms for translation of HRE materials for countries experiencing economic difficulty. For instance, a small voluntary fund to help the translation and dissemination of HRE material could be set up.

ix.     UNESCO develops systems for the monitoring of usage of translated and co-published work (e.g. contractual obligation to provide distribution information when license issued).

x.      Future commissioning processes incorporate the use of the analytical grid for this evaluation (see Appendix 1).

**Table of contents**                                    **Page No:**

**EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

**Acronyms and Abbreviations**

## Acronyms and Abbreviations

| | |
|---|---|
| ASPnet | Associated Schools Project network |
| HRE | Human Rights Education |
| UDHR | Universal Declaration of Human Rights |
| UN | United Nations |
| UNCRC | United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child |
| UNESCO | United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation |

## 1.    Context and purpose of the evaluation

1.1    In 1999, the General Conference adopted a resolution (30C/Resolution16) entitled 'Overall Strategy for human rights education'. It requested UNESCO to undertake an evaluation of its publications on human rights education. The Resolution describes the need for this evaluation as 'of the utmost importance'.

1.2    The purpose of the evaluation is to contribute to the formulation of a future strategy on human rights education.

1.3    The General Conference, advised by the Executive Board's Temporary Group on Human Rights Education, is concerned to evaluate the contribution of existing publications 'in the light of the new information and communication technologies available'.

1.4    Whilst General Conference was determined that 'UNESCO's efforts as regards the collection and diffusion of material on human rights education should be continued and strengthened', it did not commit the Organisation to further production of its own materials.

1.5    The 161st session of the Executive Board, meeting in May 2001, reviewed progress on the overall strategy for human rights education and requested that the strategy be incorporated into the 2002-2003 Programme and Budget. In December 2001, the section Education for Universal Values of UNESCO contracted the University of Leicester Centre for Citizenship Studies in Education, to conduct the evaluation.

## 2.    Terms of reference

2.1    It was agreed that the evaluation would focus on the Education Sector's latest publications in the field of human rights education, developed both at Headquarters and by Field Offices during the past Medium-Term Strategy period (1996-2001).

2.2    Staff of the section Education for Universal Values identified the following materials as those to be evaluated:

> *All human beings... Manual for human rights education*, UNESCO, 1998, 173 pages.
> *Tolerance : the threshold of peace*, Betty A. Reardon, UNESCO, 1997, 3 volumes, approx. 120 pages each.
> *Culture of democracy : a challenge for schools*, P. Meyer-Bisch, UNESCO, 1995, 143 pages.
> *Peace Package*, UNESCO-ASPnet, 2000
> *The Practice of Citizenship*, a civics education kit, UNESCO, 1998
> *Education for Human Rights and Democracy in Southern Africa*, UNESCO/Longman, 1999, 148 pages.
> *Education for Human Rights and Democracy in Namibia– Teacher's Guide,* UNESCO/Gamsberg-Macmillan, 2001, 92 pages.
> *Education for Human Rights and Democracy in Zimbabwe- History,* UNESCO, 2001, 88 pages.
> *Education for Human Rights and Democracy in Zimbabwe- Religious and Moral Education,* UNESCO, 2001, 119 pages.

2.3    The evaluation took into account UNESCO's overall strategy for human rights education, as defined by:
- the *Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms* (Paris, 1974).
- the *Declaration and Integrated Framework of Action on Education for Peace, Human Rights and Democracy* (Paris, 1995)
- other relevant UNESCO documents, including those of the General Conference and Executive Board
- the Plan of Action of the United Nations Decade for Human Rights Education (1995-2004), which assigns to UNESCO a key role in the development, implementation and evaluation of the projects undertaken during the Decade.

2.4    The evaluation included:
- a review of the selected publications and a brief analysis of their relevance to UNESCO's HRE objectives;

- a report on users' and officers' perceptions of the impact of these publications and of their capacity to be adapted to suit local culture, including an assessment of the number of copies disseminated.
- guidelines / checklist for the evaluation of HRE publications with respect to UNESCO HRE objectives
- guidelines / checklist for the future development of HRE publications
- recommendations for the future publication of HRE materials including possible partnerships with publishers and their cost implications

## 3. Methodology

3.1   The evaluation team devised an analytical grid used to assess the content of the materials against UNESCO priorities (see Appendix 1). All the materials were analysed using this grid.

3.2   In January 2002 formal face to face interviews were conducted with 11 staff at UNESCO headquarters involved with the production and/ or dissemination of human rights education materials, using an agreed interview schedule. Briefings were held with a further six staff during the two day visit. (See appendix 2).

3.3   In February and March 2002, a questionnaire was submitted by email to 31 external users of UNESCO HRE materials identified by the staff from the Section for Universal Values.   Non-respondents were followed up on two further occasions. Completed questionnaires were received from 11 users in 10 countries. A further five contacted the evaluators to indicate that they were unable to provide a response (See appendix 3).

3.4   The study is limited by the geographical distribution of the respondents.  Five responses were received from Europe, 3 from Africa and 3 from the America's. No responses were received from the Asia/Pacific region.

3.5   Data from the documentary analysis, interviews and email questionnaires provide the evidence base of this report.

3.6   The evaluation thus drew on a number of sources of data: our analysis of the HRE publications; the perceptions of users; quantitative data on translation and distribution; and the perceptions of UNESCO staff. Our overall analysis, conclusions and recommendations draw on these varied sources. The triangulation of results - with, for example evidence from user groups supporting the documentary analysis - gives the overall findings considerable reliability, despite the relatively modest numbers of user respondents.

**4.      Strategic guidance on human rights education and UNESCO publications**

4.1.    The 1974 *Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms* provides the earliest source of strategic guidance.

4.1.1 The Recommendation is addressed to Member States rather than to the Organisation itself. The word 'publications' is not used, but there are several references to 'materials'. The Recommendation gives advice to Member States as to the best way of providing appropriate materials. It suggests that teachers themselves be involved in the drafting of the materials they will use, rather than ministry officials or experts not involved in classroom teaching (paragraph 33).

4.1.2 Paragraph 38 encourages the development of materials, but this is largely seen as the responsibility of Member States:
Member States should increase their efforts to facilitate the renewal, production, dissemination and exchange of equipment and materials for international education

4.1.3 The Recommendation envisages the establishment of documentation centres, for the development and dissemination of materials. Again this is seen as the responsibility of Member States (paragraph 40).

4. 2    The 1995 *Declaration and Integrated Framework of Action on Education for Peace Human Rights and Democracy* is the most comprehensive source of current strategic directions for human rights education. There are no direct references to UNESCO publications in the document.

4.2.1 The Integrated Framework does suggest that UNESCO take steps to disseminate its own documents, especially in the poorest countries. Section IV 18 advises that:

It would be desirable for the documents of UNESCO and other United Nations institutions to be widely distributed and used in educational establishments, especially in countries where the production of teaching materials is proving slow owing to economic difficulties.

This could be taken as approval for UNESCO to provide model teaching materials, concentrating on Member States where economic circumstances prevent the production of locally produced resources.

4.3     UNESCO's Medium Term Strategy was the source of overall strategic guidance during the period when most of the resources being evaluated were produced.

4.3.1 The 1996-2001 Strategy acknowledged human rights education indirectly, linking it to education for a culture of peace. An extract from the Strategy, published on UNESCO's website, spells out the connection:

Education is at the heart of any strategy for peace-building. It is through education that the broadest possible introduction can be provided to the values, skills and knowledge which form the basis of respect for human rights and democratic principles, the rejection of violence, and a spirit of tolerance, understanding and mutual appreciation among individuals, groups and nations.

4.3.2 Amongst other objectives, the Department of Education for a Culture of Peace was expected to:

encourage improvement and innovation related to curricula, contents and teaching methods, pedagogical materials and also the training of teachers and other educational staff.

4.3.3 It can be argued that improvement and innovation in teaching materials may best be achieved by providing models. UNESCO, in its position as an international co-ordinating organisation, is well placed to commission and provide these.

4.4  UNESCO's Medium Term Strategy 2002-2007 defines the Organisation's mission as to contribute to peace and human development in an era of globalisation through education, the sciences, culture and communication. The Strategy is concerned with the implementation of rights through education.

4.4.1 The Strategy is based on three main interrelated axes:
- *developing* universal principles and norms, based on shared values, in order to meet emerging challenges in education, science, culture and communication and to protect and strengthen the 'common public good';
- *promoting* pluralism, through recognition and enhancement of diversity together with the observance of human rights;
- *promoting* empowerment and participation in the emerging knowledge society through equitable access, capacity-building and sharing of knowledge.

4.4.2 The Strategy is based on the premise that globalisation 'has injected new relevance and added new dimensions to UNESCO's longstanding mission to bolster respect for universal norms and values'.

4.4.3 The 'universal norms and values' are embodied in human rights instruments. Human rights education continues to be a priority concern for UNESCO.

4.4.4 A number of references in the Medium Term Strategy suggest that the production of model human rights education materials is an appropriate function for UNESCO. The Organisation is described as:
- a laboratory of ideas
- a standard-setter
- a clearing house

This implies that materials produced should be innovatory, of a high standard and that they disseminate good practice between member states.

4.4.5 In the case of UNESCO's education programme, strategic objectives include:
- Promoting education as a fundamental right in accordance with the Universal Declaration of Human Rights;
- Improving the quality of education through the diversification of contents and methods and the promotion of universally shared values;
- Promoting experimentation, innovation and the diffusion and sharing of information and best practices as well as policy dialogue in education.

All of these objectives can be achieved to some extent through the production of materials for human rights education.

4.4.6. Paragraph 67 of the Medium Term Strategy, in a section entitled *Promoting universally shared values through education* states:

> In a world that is still influenced by prejudice and ignorance, and torn by violence, conflict and intolerance, helping people to learn to live together is one of education's key missions. UNESCO will continue to advocate an education that promotes behaviour and values that are conducive to the development of peaceful, democratic and pluralistic societies. Nurturing understanding between peoples, fostering mutual respect and the recognition of universal values such as human rights, democracy, tolerance and non-violence, solidarity and intercultural under-standing are essential.

4.4.7 The Medium Term Strategy pledges UNESCO to help achieve the goals of two UN Decades, namely: the United Nations Decade for Human Rights Education (1995-2004) and the United Nations Decade for a Culture of Peace and Non-Violence for the Children of the World (2001- 2010). The decades are set within the framework of existing commitments to HRE enshrined in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and subsequent international instruments. Both decades require human rights education and UNESCO's contribution could legitimately include the production and dissemination of materials for human rights education.

**Box 4.1**
**A definition of Human Rights Education**

Human rights education has its source in the text of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. The preamble affirms that the achievement of human rights depends not only on political and legal action, but essentially also on education. It commits individuals, organisations and states to teach and educate in order to promote respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms.

> This Universal Declaration of Human Rights [is] a common standard of achievement for all peoples and all nations, to the end that every individual and every organ of society, keeping this Declaration constantly in mind, shall *strive by teaching and education to promote respect for these rights and freedoms*

Human rights education is therefore education intended to ensure familiarity with the Universal Declaration and other internationally recognised normative standards. It goes further than mere knowledge because it is also intended to promote respect for human rights.

The 1995 Declaration and Integrated Framework of Action on Education for Peace, Human Rights and Democracy develops UNESCO's definition of human rights education. It recognises the contributions of *both formal and non-formal education.* All education 'should promote *knowledge, values, attitudes and skills* conducive to respect for human rights' and also 'an *active commitment* to the defence of such rights and to the building of a culture of peace and democracy'. Such education can contribute to *sustainable development.*

The UNESCO Declaration suggests that ideally human rights education should be integrated within all educational provision. However, it recognises the necessity of specific human rights education and of specific educational priorities linked to the achievement of human rights. In particular it prioritises 'action to eliminate all direct and indirect *discrimination against girls'* and the education of 'children and young people, who are particularly vulnerable to incitements to *intolerance, racism and xenophobia'.*

The Declaration also emphasises the importance of process as much as content. It expects education to be based on:
> *principles and methods* that contribute to the development of the personality of pupils, students and adults who are respectful of their fellow human beings and determined to promote peace, human rights and democracy.

In particular it recognises the importance of an appropriate climate for learning about human rights. Educational institutions need to develop:
> *an atmosphere* contributing to the success of education for international understanding, so that they become ideal places for the exercise of tolerance, respect for human rights, the practice of democracy and learning about the diversity and wealth of cultural identities.

**5.    A framework for the evaluation of resources in the light of UNESCO goals and priorities**

5.1    The 1974 *Recommendation concerning Education for International Understanding, Co-operation and Peace and Education relating to Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms* and the 1995 *Declaration and Integrated Framework of Action on Education for Peace, Human Rights and Democracy* provides guidance as to the content of human rights education.

5.1.1 The 1974 Recommendation defines human rights in terms of normative instruments, particularly the Universal Declaration of Human Rights.  It identifies the key concepts that are essential for an understanding of human rights namely: peace, democracy, tolerance, solidarity and equality.

5.1.2 The 1995 Declaration also notes the importance of establishing a normative international framework of standards by including within human rights education information about the United Nations and UNESCO. It suggests that it would be desirable for the documents of UNESCO and other United Nations institutions to be widely distributed and used in educational establishments.

5.1.3 It also identifies key issues and challenges facing the international community which should be explored in the context of human rights education. These include: sustainable development, violence, racism, sexism, terrorism, cultural, racial and religious intolerance, and global interdependence.

5.1.4 The Declaration notes that human rights education is not just about imparting knowledge but also involves the promotion of values, attitudes and skills conducive to respect for human rights. Students should be prepared to promote peace, tolerance, race and gender equality. They should be sympathetic to non-violent conflict resolution, antiracism and sustainable development and have a global or international perspective. The development of  such attitudes is considered to require the use of active methods, group work, the discussion of moral issues and personalised teaching.

5.1.5 The Declaration also draws attention to the importance of process, namely the practice of rights.  Human rights education and the way in which classrooms and schools are run should reflect the concepts and values being covered.  It highlights, for example, the importance of democratic school management and of involving teachers, pupils, parents and the local community in human rights education.

5.1.6 With regard to textbooks, the Declaration highlights the value of projects and materials that result from national or international collaborative work and those that encourage innovative work or the sharing of good practice.

5.1.7 Acknowledgement is given to the considerable influence of the media on the socialisation of children and on their knowledge and views about the wider world. Providing young people with the skills to critically analyse media information is emphasised.

5.2 Given the above guidance, we would expect publications with a UNESCO imprint to:

- Cover particular concepts and issues (for example issues relating to peace, democracy, human rights, tolerance and sustainable development)
- Promote active teaching methods
- Promote the development of values, attitudes and skills and not just knowledge
- Promote the development of educational institutions as sites where human rights and democracy are practised
- Draw attention to significant UN documents and contain core text from these documents
- Support an interdisciplinary approach to the teaching of human rights
- Include activities that will lead to a critical analysis of the use of the media
- Encourage the development of innovative approaches and the sharing of best practice
- Challenge discrimination and promote diversity
- Be the result of or promote joint projects, either nationally or internationally or involve the exchange of experiences, ideas or research

5.3 The nine resources reviewed can be categorised into three groups.

- Books that focus on human rights education from a generic, international perspective.

- Books that set the human rights education content within a particular national context.

- Resource packs that combine a number of different resources.  One of these is a more generic school resource whose components are to be used selectively while the second is an individual teacher resource that would be used for a specific unit of work.

**6.**

6.1     *Manual for Human Rights Education*

| Title | All Human Beings … Manual for Human Rights Education |
|---|---|
| **Date** | 1998 |
| **Pages** | 172 |
| **Format** | Paperback (17x24cm) |
| **Co-published** | The Teacher's Library |
| **Sponsorship** | N/A |
| **Audience** | Primary and secondary teachers, educators in non-formal settings, secondary pupils (some parts) |

6.1.1 This resource was developed as a contribution to the 50th anniversary of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights.  It aims to help students and teachers at primary and secondary level to understand the universal elements of human rights.  It provides basic documentation, specific teaching materials and some practical exercises.  It is intended as a generic text and includes examples from around the world although these come mainly from Europe, Africa and Central America with an absence of examples from the Middle East and the Asia-Pacific region.  Attention has been paid to making human rights principles meaningful to children's daily lives and experiences.  Active teaching methods, an inter-disciplinary approach and the learning of values, attitudes and skills alongside knowledge are all promoted in this text.

6.1.2 Key normative instruments are made available within the text. *The Universal Declaration of Human Rights* and *The Convention on the Rights of the Child* are attached as appendices but they are also referred to and form an integral part of some sections of the book.

6.1.3 Contents
*An approach to human rights*
This chapter sets out a rationale, background information and an approach to human rights education and contextualises the rest of the book.  It includes coverage of basic concepts (for example, freedom, equality, justice), the links between certain concepts (for example, democracy and human rights) and introduces significant documents such as the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child and Universal Declaration of Human Rights.  Throughout this chapter, specialised words referred to in the text are defined in a highlighted part of the margin (for example, ratification, declaration, democracy, covenant, protocol, resolution).

*A method for human rights education*
This chapter makes suggestions and gives advice on how all educational disciplines can embrace the objectives inherent in human rights education.  Ideas are general and designed to be further developed to fit the particular context of users.

*Understanding human rights in the classroom*
This is the main part of the book and is comprised of a series of 'educational tales' – pedagogical examples that have been tried out and that provide an approach for educational work concerning a specific right. It is more detailed than the previous chapter and all activities are linked in to the UNHR which is quoted and referred to throughout. This section is clearly set out, most examples are activity based and look like they would have appeal to learners.

*Appendices*
The Universal Declaration of Human Rights
The Convention on the Rights of the Child

6.1.4 Coverage of the key concepts and issues:

| Theme | Very full coverage | Some coverage | Mentioned | Not mentioned |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Non-violent conflict resolution | | | x | |
| Tolerance | | x | | |
| Democracy | | x | | |
| Antiracism | | | x | |
| Gender Equality | | x | | |
| Human rights | x | | | |
| Religious intolerance | | x | | |
| Sustainable development | | x | | |
| Terrorism | | | | x |
| UNESCO and UN | | | x | |
| Human rights texts e.g. UDHR, UNCRC | x | | | |
| International dimension | | x | | |
| Cultural diversity | | | x | |

6.1.5 Distribution

| English | 2400 sales  750 free |
|---|---|
| French | 1400 sales  1000 distributed free |
| Portuguese | 15 000 |
| Turkish | 15 000 |
| Finnish | 3000 |
| Lithuanian | 2000 |
| *Planned* | |
| Serbia | 5000 |
| Jamaica | 4000 in English |
| Tunisia | 1500 in Arabic |
| Japan | 1000 |
| Kosova | 500 in Albanian and 200 in Bosnian |

6.2    *Tolerance: the threshold of peace*

| Title | Tolerance - the threshold of peace:  primary-school resource unit |
| --- | --- |
| | Tolerance - the threshold of peace:  secondary-school resource unit |
| | Tolerance - the threshold of peace:  teacher training resource unit |
| Date | 1997 |
| Pages | 98, 114 and 136 respectively |
| Format | Paperback (17x24cm) |
| Co-published | The Teacher's Library |
| Sponsorship | N/A |
| Audience | Teacher educators, adult education facilitators, classroom teachers and educators in non-formal settings |

6.2.1 These three distinct but interrelated units were produced as a contribution to the UN Year for Tolerance and are designed to encourage and facilitate education for tolerance and to act as a catalyst for the development of other resources.

6.2.2 The first unit (teacher training resource) provides a statement of the problems of intolerance, a rationale for educating for tolerance, and concepts and descriptions for identifying problems and goals.

6.2.3 The next two units (one for primary schools and one for secondary schools) consist of teaching materials organised around three themes:  Living with Human Diversity, Dealing with Conflict and Exercising Responsibility.  Many of the activities are derived from materials sent to UNESCO from all over the world although as with the previous resource, there were few examples from the Middle East and the Asia-Pacific regions.

6.2.4 The ideas are generic, being presented in general terms rather than in specific detail. Thus they can easily be adapted for use in many countries.  This resource promotes active teaching methods, an inter-disciplinary approach and the teaching of values, attitudes and skills as well as knowledge.

6.2.5 Key normative instruments made available within the text:
Unit 1 - *The Declaration and Integrated Framework of Action on Education for Peace, Human Rights and Democracy* (1995) and *The Declaration of Principles on Tolerance* (1995) attached as appendices (in their entireties).

Unit 2 – *Universal Declaration of Human Rights* (1948), the *Declaration on the Rights of the Child* (1959) and *Convention on the Rights of the Child* (1989) included as appendices.

Unit 3 - *Universal Declaration of Human Rights* (1948), the *Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women* (condensed) and the *Declaration on the Rights of Persons Belonging to National or Ethnic, Religious and Linguistic Minorities* included as appendices.

6.2.6 Unit 1 Contents
Chapters 1-4 (rationale, context and framework for education for tolerance)
- Why education for tolerance?
- Diagnosing intolerance and describing tolerance
- Problems and possibilities of educating for tolerance
- Tolerance in the school: a laboratory for the practice of tolerance
- Suggestions for teaching tolerance (This chapter describes a variety of school-based projects and activities to educate for tolerance.  They come from all over the world with the main aim being to highlight possibilities.  The chapter also offers some general guidance on how to integrate education for tolerance into school curricula).
- Popular education and popular movements (This section is for non-formal adult educators).

6.2.7 Units 2 and 3 Contents
- Diagnosing intolerance among students and teachers
- Characteristics of the tolerant classroom
- A process approach to learning the realms of tolerance
- Learning goals of education for peace, human rights and democracy
- Selected learning activities (the bulk of the book)

6.2.8 Coverage

| Theme | Very full coverage | Some coverage | Mentioned | Not mentioned |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Non-violent conflict resolution | x | | | |
| Tolerance | x | | | |
| Democracy | | | | |
| Antiracism | | | x | |
| Gender Equality | | x | | |
| Human rights | | x | | |
| Religious intolerance | | x | | |
| Sustainable development | | | | |
| Terrorism | | | | x |
| UNESCO and UN | | | x | |
| Human rights texts e.g. UDHR, UNCRC | | x | | |
| International dimension | | x | | |
| Cultural diversity | x | | | |

6.2.9 Distribution

| English | 1800 |
|---|---|
| French | 1400 |
| Spanish | 6000 |
| Hindi | 5000 |
| Lithuanian | 3500 |
| Turkish | 2000 |
| Arabic (Kuwait) | 2000 |
| Albanian (Albania) | 1000 |

6.3     *Culture of Democracy*

| Title | Culture of Democracy:  a challenge for schools |
|-------|------------------------------------------------|
| **Date** | 1995 |
| **Pages** | 143 |
| **Format** | Paperback (17x24cm) |
| **Co-published** | N/A |
| **Sponsorship** | N/A |
| **Audience** | School management, teachers, teacher educators |

6.3.1 This book was developed in response to requests to UNESCO for teaching material to support education for democracy and also to mark the 40th anniversary of ASPnet.  It is not a classroom text in the same way that some of the others are.  It presents and discusses examples of innovative educational activities focusing on democracy and citizenship that have been carried out by schools taking part in UNESCO's Associated Schools Projects in different parts of the world.  In doing so, it aims to promote further development of teaching activities and materials.  The book promotes active teaching methods and a multi- and interdisciplinary approach to the teaching of human rights.

6.3.2 The one key international texts made available within the text is the *World Plan of Action for Human Rights and Democracy* (Montreal, 1993). This is included as an appendix and referred to briefly in the book.

6.3.3 Contents
*Fragments of the culture of democracy: analysis*
This chapter is more a philosophical discussion than a practical tool for teachers. It discusses possibilities.  It does include examples taken from different countries, namely, a school charter, a pupils' parliament, simulations of democratic bodies, non-violent conflict resolution, school newspapers and intercultural initiatives.

*Teaching democratic principles in pre-school education*
Examples from Costa Rica and France (an illustrated story, welcoming a disabled child, grandparents' day, banquet of the countries of the world, cultural evenings and exhibitions, the school newspaper, environmental and conflict resolution activities).

*Learning about citizenship at primary school*
Examples from the Republic of Korea focused on intercultural and conflict resolution activities.

*Secondary education: participating in the culture of democracy*
Examples from Hungary, Senegal and Switzerland including introducing democracy, discrimination against women, non-violent conflict resolution, intercultural education and a simulation of the General Assembly.

*Training teachers*
Examples from Columbia and the Philippines

*Education for democracies: synthesis*

*Appendix*: World Plan of Action for Human Rights and Democracy (Montreal, 1993)

6.3.4 Coverage

| Theme | Very full coverage | Some coverage | Mentioned | Not mentioned |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Non-violent conflict resolution | | x | | |
| Tolerance | | x | | |
| Democracy | x | | | |
| Antiracism | | | | x |
| Gender Equality | | x | | |
| Human rights | x | | | |
| Religious intolerance | | x | | |
| Sustainable development | | x | | |
| Terrorism | | | | x |
| UNESCO and UN | | | x | |
| Human rights texts e.g. UDHR, UNCRC | | x | | |
| International dimension | | x | | |
| Cultural diversity | | x | | |

6.3.5 Distribution

| English | 5000 |
|---|---|
| French | 4000 |
| Spanish | N/A |
| Albanian | In preparation |
| Bosnian | In preparation |

6.4   *Peace Package*

| Title | Peace Package |
|---|---|
| Date | 2000 |
| Format | Teaching pack – various resources |
| Contents | <ul><li>A video of six short cartoons</li><li>The Life of Mahatma Gandhi colouring book</li><li>'Tolerance-Respect' poster (85 x 60 cm)</li><li>Universal Declaration of Human Rights poster (65 x 47 cm)</li><li>'Peace' poster (60 x 40 cm)</li><li>Teacher's Handbook (33 pages)</li><li>Activity cards (inserted into back cover of Teacher's Handbook)</li><li>Children's Appeals to World Leaders (seven different countries)</li></ul> |
| Co-published | N/A |
| Sponsorship | N/A |
| Audience | Primary school teachers/children |

6.4.1 This resource has been sent to primary schools participating in ASPnet and reflects some of the ideas and teaching methods developed through this project.  It was developed as a contribution to the International Year for the Culture of Peace (2000) and was based on the original Peace Pack that resulted from the seven UNESCO ASPnet sub-regional Peace Festivals.

6.4.2 It has been designed as an individual teacher resource to be used for a specific unit of work.  It provides teachers with practical materials to promote respect for human rights, democratic principles, tolerance, respect and intercultural understanding.

6.4.3 The Teacher's Handbook provides a guide on how to use each item in the pack.  It also includes background information on UNESCO and the various concepts covered in the pack as well as additional activity suggestions.

6.4.4 Each illustrated activity card includes a range of suggested activities, discussion points and a short 'Did you know?' section on the UN and UNESCO.  The cards cover the concepts of peace, tolerance, respect, non-violent conflict resolution, human rights, sustainable development and intercultural learning (English only)

6.4.5 The 'Peace' poster is made up of seven smaller pictures and statements relating to peace with questions for class or group discussion on the back (captions in English and French). The UDHR poster presents each of the 30 articles accompanied by an illustration (English only).

6.4.6 The video presents six short cartoons created by children for children for an ASPnet cartoon contest.  Each short story portrays a message or idea related to an aspect of peace.  No spoken language is used in the stories.

6.4.7 Coverage

| Theme | Very full coverage | Some coverage | Mentioned | Not mentioned |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Non-violent conflict resolution | | x | | |
| Tolerance | | x | | |
| Democracy | | | | |
| Antiracism | | | x | |
| Gender Equality | | x | | |
| Human rights | | x | | |
| Religious intolerance | | x | | |
| Sustainable development | | x | | |
| Terrorism | | | | x |
| UNESCO and UN | | x | | |
| Human rights texts e.g. UDHR, UNCRC | | x | | |
| International dimension | | x | | |
| Cultural diversity | | x | | |

6.4.8 Distribution

| English | N/A |
|---|---|
| French | N/A |
| Japanese | 1000 |
| Armenian | 1000 planned |
| Azerbaijani | 700  planned |

6.5    *The Practice of Citizenship*

| Title | The Practice of Citizenship |
|---|---|
| Date | 1999 |
| Format | A civics education pack (11 separate resources) |
| Contents | 1.  Declaration and Integrated framework of Action on Education for Peace, Human Rights and Democracy (1995) (14 pages)<br>2.  All Human Beings … Manual for Human Rights Education (1998) (173 pages)<br>3.  ABC Teaching Human Rights – practical activities for primary and secondary schools (1989) (56 pages)<br>4.  Tolerance: the threshold of peace (1997) (3 separate volumes)<br>5.  Culture of Democracy: a challenge for schools (1995) (143 pages)<br>6.  Human Rights: questions and answers (1996) (148 pages)<br>7.  Tolerance in Films (1997) (84 pages)<br>8.  Guidelines for Curriculum and Textbook development in International Education (1995) (22 pages)<br>9.  School Effectiveness and Education f or Democracy and Non-Violence (1997) (10 pages)<br>10. A Selected List of UNESCO Practical and Reference Materials Related to Civics Education (1997) (17 pages)<br>11. Violence Prevention: an important element of a health-promoting school (1999) (52 pages) |
| Co-published | Some of the resources are co-published |
| Sponsorship | Financial contributions from the UK and USA |
| Audience | Teachers, school management, local and national educational administrators concerned with civics education |

6.5.1 This kit consists of eleven different UNESCO publications, all of which contribute to the promotion of education in the areas of human rights, democracy and international understanding.  It is a generic school resource whose components can be used selectively.

6.5.2 Some of the resources can be used directly by teachers in classrooms while others are aimed primarily at school administrators or are reference materials that support education in these areas.  Three of these resources (*All Human Beings… Manual for Human Rights Education, 1998; Tolerance: the threshold of peace, 1997; Culture of Democracy, 1995*) are included separately in this evaluation.

6.5.3 Coverage

| Theme | Very full coverage | Some coverage | Mentioned | Not mentioned |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Non-violent conflict resolution | | x | | |
| Tolerance | x | | | |
| Democracy | x | | | |
| Antiracism | | | x | |
| Gender Equality | | x | | |
| Human rights | x | | | |
| Religious intolerance | | x | | |
| Sustainable development | | x | | |
| Terrorism | | | | x |
| UNESCO and UN | | x | | |
| Human rights texts e.g. UDHR, UNCRC | | x | | |
| International dimension | | x | | |
| Cultural diversity | | x | | |

6.5.4  Initial distribution in 1998 of 400 kits in English and 250 in French.  In 1999, 150 kits were produced in Spanish. Subsequently the Education Department of South Australia made a further contribution and requested a further 250 kits. Other Member States that have responded positively to the kit include: Argentina, Bangladesh, Brazil, Canada, Chile, El Salvador, India, Kenya, Pakistan, Uruguay, Uzbekistan.

## 6.6 *Education for Human Rights and Democracy in Southern Africa*

| Title | Education for Human Rights and Democracy in Southern Africa: a teacher's resource manual |
|---|---|
| **Date** | 1999 |
| **Pages** | 148 |
| **Format** | Paperback (17x24cm) |
| **Co-published** | Longman |
| **Sponsorship** | DANIDA |
| **Audience** | Teachers (both primary and secondary) |

6.6.1 This manual is a generic resource intended to be used by all schools in the region (Southern Africa). It is intended to be accompanied by supplementary instructional materials. The manual provides information about peace, democracy and human rights and suggestions for developing knowledge, skills and values in these areas. It includes background information and readings for teachers about the various topics.

6.6.2 The content is organised around five main themes:
- Peace and conflict
- Culture and diversity
- Equal rights for all
- Fundamental freedoms and democracy
- The environment and sustainable development

6.6.3 Each theme has an introductory page that highlights learning objectives which are categorised into: knowledge and concepts, values and attitudes, skills. Each topic in the themes contains one or more suggested activities but teachers are encouraged to develop others.

6.6.4 Pedagogy is discussed briefly, in particular the importance of adopting teaching methods that reflect and support the concepts and values being taught. The ideas presented are practical in nature including role-playing, simulation, drama, debate, brainstorming and discussions. Extensive use is also made of stories and case studies.

6.6.5 Brief references are made to the UDHR and UNCRC in several places and a glossary is included at the end of the book.

6.6.6 Coverage

| Theme | Very full coverage | Some coverage | Mentioned | Not mentioned |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Non-violent conflict resolution | x | | | |
| Tolerance | | x | | |
| Democracy | x | | | |
| Antiracism | | | x | |
| Gender Equality | | x | | |
| Human rights | x | | | |
| Religious intolerance | | x | | |
| Sustainable development | | x | | |
| Terrorism | | | | x |
| UNESCO and UN | | | x | |
| Human rights texts e.g. UDHR, UNCRC | | | x | |
| International dimension | | | x | |
| Cultural diversity | x | | | |

6.6.7 4000 copies were printed, of which 1500 went to pilot schools and other national stakeholders in Namibia and a further 1500 to pilot schools in Zimbabwe. Mozambique arranged for a translation to be used in its pilot schools. As this is a co-published resource, UNESCO publishing does not monitor the figures.

6.7    *Education for Human Rights and Democracy in Namibia*

| Title | Education for Human Rights and Democracy in Namibia: Teachers' Guide |
|---|---|
| **Date** | 2001 |
| **Pages** | 92 |
| **Format** | Paperback (A4) |
| **Co-published** | Gamsberg Macmillan |
| **Sponsorship** | DANIDA |
| **Audience** | Teachers (upper primary), teacher educators |

6.7.1 This resource aims to assist educators to incorporate into their teaching some of the essential issues, concepts, skills and processes related to human rights and democracy.  It is intended to be used in conjunction with the teacher's resource manual *Education for Human Rights and Democracy in Southern Africa* (1999).  It is not a 'recipe book' or the definitive answer to human rights education but is designed more to stimulate teachers and learners to become active and creative participants in their own learning and to construct additional activities to the ones presented.

6.7.2 The guide consists of six units that cover a range of issues and concepts relevant to human rights and democracy in Namibia, each with its own specific aims, objectives and activities and complete lesson plans.  Activities can be used selectively and are designed to be integrated into various subjects.  Each unit contains a glossary of the key concepts and ideas relevant to the unit.

6.7.3 Objectives, level, subjects, time required, method and lessons content are set out clearly for each activity.  Photocopiable pages are included as is a glossary of the key concepts and ideas relevant to each unit.  Some content/activities relates specifically to Namibia and therefore would need to be adapted for use in other countries but the structure is such that this could be done quite easily.

6.7.4 Contents
Unit One: Violence, Conflict and Peace
Unit Two: Namibian History and Independence
Unit Three:  Multi-culturalism and Education for Human Rights and Democracy
Unit Four:  Potentially Vulnerable Groups
Unit Five:  Economic and Labour Rights
Unit Six:  Environmental Rights and Sustainable Development

6.7.5 Coverage

| Theme | Very full coverage | Some coverage | Mentioned | Not mentioned |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Non-violent conflict resolution | x | | | |
| Tolerance | | x | | |
| Democracy | | x | | |
| Antiracism | | | x | |
| Gender Equality | | x | | |
| Human rights | x | | | |
| Religious intolerance | | x | | |
| Sustainable development | | x | | |
| Terrorism | | | | x |
| UNESCO and UN | | x | | |
| Human rights texts e.g. UDHR, UNCRC | | | x | |
| International dimension | | | x | |
| Cultural diversity | x | | | |

6.7.6 2000 copies were printed for distribution to pilot schools in Namibia.

6.8    *Education for Human Rights and Democracy in Zimbabwe*

| Title | Education for Human Rights and Democracy in Zimbabwe:  forms 1-2 history |
|---|---|
| **Date** | 2001 |
| **Pages** | 87 |
| **Format** | Paperback (17x24cm) |
| **Co-published** | Danida |
| **Sponsorship** | Danida |
| **Audience** | Secondary teachers |

6.8.1 This book was developed to support the 'Education for Human Rights and Democracy' pilot project being implemented in Southern Africa (Mozambique, Namibia, Zimbabwe).  The project aims to support the teaching and learning of human rights and democracy as part of the school curriculum in selected subjects and this particular text has been developed for use in History.  It is intended as a supplementary text to be used alongside the main text for that subject and the Teacher's Resource Manual on Human Rights and Democracy.

6.8.2 For each chapter, the book makes explicit the links with the history curriculum and also includes:
- An introduction to particular concepts
- Activities for pupils
- Revision exercises
- Glossary of unfamiliar terms

6.8.3 Information about the UDHR and UNCRC is provided in the text and is required for some of the exercises although the book does not include these documents. Other documents are also referred to and discussed (for example, The Zimbabwe constitution, the African Charter on Human and People's Rights, the African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women).

6.8.4 Content
- Human Rights and Democracy Concepts and Issues (includes coverage of the UDHR, the rights of minority groups, people with disabilities, albinos, those with HIV/AIDs, environmental issues)
- Slave Trade, Slavery and Contemporary Forms of Slavery (some content relates specifically to Zimbabwe)
- Fundamental Freedoms (again, some content relates specifically re Zimbabwe)
- Workers' Rights (as above)
- Democracy
- Children's Rights, Duties and Responsibilities
- Gender Equity and equality

- Promotion and Protection of Human Rights

Appendix 1 Constitution of Zimbabwe chapter 3 (extracts)

Appendix 2 African Charter on Human Rights and People's Rights (simplified)

6.8.5 Coverage

| Theme | Very full coverage | Some coverage | Mentioned | Not mentioned |
|-------|--------------------|---------------|-----------|---------------|
| Non-violent conflict resolution | | | | x |
| Tolerance | | x | | |
| Democracy | x | | | |
| Antiracism | | | x | |
| Gender Equality | | x | | |
| Human rights | x | | | |
| Religious intolerance | | x | | |
| Sustainable development | | x | | |
| Terrorism | | | | x |
| UNESCO and UN | | | x | |
| Human rights texts e.g. UDHR, UNCRC | | x | | |
| International dimension | | | | x |
| Cultural diversity | | x | | |

6.8.6 2000 copies were printed for distribution to pilot schools in Zimbabwe.

6.9    *Education for Human Rights and Democracy in Zimbabwe: religion and moral education*

| Title | Education for Human Rights and Democracy in Zimbabwe: forms 1-2 religious and moral education |
|---|---|
| **Date** | 2001 |
| **Pages** | 119 |
| **Format** | Paperback (17x24cm) |
| **Co-published** | Danida |
| **Sponsorship** | Danida |
| **Audience** | Secondary teachers |

6.9.1 This book was developed to support the 'Education for Human Rights and Democracy' pilot project being implemented in southern Africa (Mozambique, Namibia, Zimbabwe). The project aims to support the teaching and learning of human rights and democracy concepts as an integral part of the school curriculum in selected subjects and this particular text has been developed for use in Religious and Moral Education. It is a supplementary text to be used alongside the main text for that subject and the Teacher's Resource Manual on Human Rights and Democracy.

6.9.2 For each chapter, the book makes explicit the links with the Religious and Moral Education syllabus. The book devotes separate chapters to the discussion of particular human rights issues with each chapter identifying what the Law, the Bible, the Qur'an, the Baha'i holy writings say about each issue. Some content relates specifically to the Zimbabwean context while other parts are more generic.

6.9.3 Contents
There is a short introduction on the concept of human rights and rationale for studying them.
- The right to life
- Freedom from torture and inhuman treatment
- Freedom of movement and expression
- Freedom of thought and action
- Freedom of association and assembly
- Right to fair trial
- Children's rights
- Right to marry
- Non-discrimination
- Gender equity and equality
- The right to work
- Duties and responsibilities
- Characteristics of a good leader
Appendix 1 UDHR (simplified)
Appendix 2 Extract from the Zimbabwean constitution (chapter iii, simplified)

6.9.4 Coverage

| Theme | Very full coverage | Some coverage | Mentioned | Not mentioned |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Non-violent conflict resolution | | x | | |
| Tolerance | | x | | |
| Democracy | x | | | |
| Antiracism | | | x | |
| Gender Equality | | x | | |
| Human rights | x | | | |
| Religious intolerance | x | | | |
| Sustainable development | | | | x |
| Terrorism | | | | x |
| UNESCO and UN | | | x | |
| Human rights texts e.g. UDHR, UNCRC | | x | | |
| International dimension | | | | x |
| Cultural diversity | | x | | |

6.9.5 1000 copies were printed for distribution to pilot schools in Zimbabwe.

**7.      The impact and relevance of the resources: user perceptions**

7.1.   Seventeen of the thirty people initially contacted responded to the questionnaire. Of those seventeen, six people indicated that they were unable to complete the questionnaire for various reasons (see Appendix 3).

7.1.1 Completed questionnaires were received from eleven educators from ten different countries across Africa, Eastern Europe, Scandinavia, North and Central America. These respondents were engaged in a wide range of Human Rights Education activities including: programme and curriculum development, involvement in specific projects, development and production of teaching and learning materials, teaching university courses, training others such as teachers, youth leaders and local administrators, translating international documents and undertaking research. Two of the respondents worked directly for UNESCO.

7.2   Nine of the eleven respondents indicated familiarity with the 1995 Declaration with two of these reporting that this document has been translated into their national language and widely distributed to schools and teacher training institutes. Opinion about this document was positive with several respondents indicating that they valued the way in which it sets out goals, priorities and guidelines for work in the HRE field.

7.3   Nine respondents reported using the 1995 Declaration and five of those also reported using the 1974 document. Use of nine other UN or UNESCO documents was noted. These included:
*   Declaration on the Principles of Tolerance
*   UN Convention on the Rights of the Child
*   World Plan of Action for Human Rights & Democracy (Montreal, 1993)
*   Declaration & Programme of Action (Vienna, 1993)
*   The UNESCO Constitution
*   Convention against Discrimination in Education
*   Convention on Vocational Education and Training
*   Recommendation on the Status of Teachers
*   World Declaration on Education for All

7.3.1 The usefulness of these documents was seen largely in terms of their international status and the way in which they set out standards, suggestions and guidance.

7.3.2 Respondents reported that the documents were used to influence or assist in curriculum and programme development as well as in the development of educational materials, performance standards, initial and in-service teacher training and research and policy relating to Human Rights Education. In one case, and in the words of one respondent, these documents were used,

*to lobby policy makers to support the project I was working on and to remind them of the moral obligations their respective countries have taken upon themselves by being party to the declarations and recommendations.*

7.4 Respondents' familiarity with and use of UNESCO human rights education resources

| | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | Total |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| *All human beings... Manual for Human Rights Education* | | x | x | | x | x | x | x | x | x | x | 9 |
| *Tolerance* | x | x | x | x | x | x | x | x | x | x | x | 11 |
| *Culture of democracy* | x | | x | x | x | x | | x | x | x | x | 9 |
| *Peace Package* | | | x | | | | | x | | | | 2 |
| *The Practice of Citizenship* | x | x | x | x | x | x | x | | x | x | x | 10 |
| *Education for human rights and democracy/Southern Africa* | | | | x | | | x | | | | | 2 |
| *Education for human rights and democracy/Namibia* | | | | | | | y | | | | | 1 |
| *Education for human rights and democracy/Zimbabwe-history* | | | | | x | | x | | | | | 2 |
| *Education for human rights and democracy/Zimbabwe-religious* | | | | | | | x | | | | | 1 |

7.4.1 Four of the listed resources had been used by nine or more of the respondents. These were:

- *All human beings... Manual for Human Rights Education (1997)*
- *Tolerance – the threshold of peace (1997)*
- *Culture of democracy (1995)*
- *The Practice of Citizenship pack (1998)*

7.4.2 The other five resources had been used by only one or two respondents. Four of these were the resources produced specifically for use in Southern Africa and it would therefore be expected that their use would be limited to that continent sub-region.

7.4.3 Respondents reported using the various resources for a range of purposes but in general terms they were used predominantly as reference and resource materials. They were used for example in:

- Curriculum design and policy development
- The development of teaching and assessment materials
- Direct use in schools (for example as a source of material for lessons)
- Training purposes (university courses as well as initial teaching training and in-service training)
- To support the implementation of a specific human rights education project

7.4.4 Almost all respondents thought that the resources are or could be used both in schools and teacher training with the exception of the Peace Pack which respondents thought would be used mainly in schools.

7.5     Perceived usefulness of these resources in relation to UNESCO priorities.

7.5.1 In making judgements about the usefulness of the resources, respondents used a four-point scale ranging from 'Very useful' to 'Not very useful' across five identified UNESCO themes.

7.5.2 These judgements are subjective and the four categories are broad and allow a limited analysis of usefulness.  The way in which a resource is used also impacts on its usefulness and effectiveness.  Bearing these limitations in mind, respondents' opinions on the usefulness of each of the resources has been collated and presented below.

7.5.3 *All Human Beings… Manual for Human Rights Education* had been used by eight of the respondents and was perceived as 'Useful' or 'Very useful' across all five themes by almost all respondents.  Two respondents viewed this resource as less useful in terms of anti-racism work while one saw it as less useful in relation to 'tolerance'.

| Title:  *All Human Beings*<br>Number of responses: 9 | Very useful | Useful | A bit useful | Not very useful |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Themes   Non-violence | 5 | 4 | | |
| Tolerance | 8 | 1 | 1 | |
| Democracy | 5 | 4 | | |
| Antiracism | 6 | 1 | 2 | |
| Human rights | 8 | 1 | | |

7.5.4 *Tolerance – the threshold of peace* had been used by all eleven respondents, and again, was viewed as 'Very useful' of 'Useful' by almost all of them, across the five themes.  One person viewed it as only 'A bit useful' across most themes while an additional person viewed it as less useful in terms of democracy.

| Title:  *Tolerance*<br>Number of responses:  11 | Very useful | Useful | A bit useful | Not very useful | Missing response |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Themes   Non-violence | 4 | 6 | 1 | | |
| Tolerance | 7 | 4 | | | |
| Democracy | 5 | 4 | 2 | | |
| Antiracism | 6 | 4 | 1 | | |
| Human rights | 6 | 3 | 1 | | 1 |

7.5.5 *Culture of Democracy* had also been used by a large proportion of respondents, most of whom viewed it as 'Very useful' or 'Useful' across the five themes.  As with *All Human Beings*, anti-racism stood out as the theme that was less well covered.

| Title:  *Culture of Democracy*<br>Number of responses:  8 | Very useful | Useful | A bit useful | Not very useful |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Themes   Non-violence | 5 | 3 | 1 | |
| Tolerance | 4 | 4 | 1 | |
| Democracy | 5 | 3 | 1 | |
| Antiracism | 2 | 5 | 2 | |
| Human rights | 4 | 5 | | |

7.5.6 The *Practice of Citizenship* pack, used by nine of the respondents, was also viewed positively in terms of its usefulness across the five themes.  'Anti-racism' and 'non-violence' were the two themes that were perceived as less well covered by this resource.

| Title:  *The Practice of Citizenship*<br>Number of responses:  10 | Very useful | Useful | A bit useful | Not very useful | Missing response |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Themes   Non-violence | 6 | 2 | 2 | | |
| Tolerance | 6 | 3 | 1 | | |
| Democracy | 6 | 2 | 1 | | 1 |
| Antiracism | 4 | 3 | 2 | | 1 |
| Human rights | 7 | 2 | 1 | | |

7.5.7 The Peace Package, was used by only two of the respondents, one of whom viewed it as 'Very useful', except in the area of 'anti-racism', while the other viewed it as 'A bit useful' across the five themes.

| Title:  *Peace Package*<br>Number of responses:  2 | Very useful | Useful | A bit useful | Not very useful |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Themes   Non-violence | 1 | | 1 | |
| Tolerance | 1 | | 1 | |
| Democracy | 1 | | 1 | |
| Antiracism | | 1 | 1 | |
| Human rights | 1 | | 1 | |

7.5.8 The four resources produced specifically for Southern Africa had been used by just one or two of the respondents.  They were viewed as useful across the five themes or as very useful in the case of human rights.  For three of the four resources, one person viewed the resources as less useful in terms of coverage of anti-racism.

| Title: *Education for Human Rights &* *Democracy in Southern Africa* Number of responses: 2 | Very useful | Useful | A bit useful | Not very useful |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Themes   Non-violence | | 2 | | |
| Tolerance | | 1 | 1 | |
| Democracy | | 2 | | |
| Antiracism | | 1 | 1 | |
| Human rights | 1 | 1 | | |

| Title: *Education for Human Rights and* *Democracy/Namibia* Number of responses: 1 | Very useful | Useful | A bit useful | Not very useful |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Themes   Non-violence | | 1 | | |
| Tolerance | | 1 | | |
| Democracy | | 1 | | |
| Antiracism | | | 1 | |
| Human rights | 1 | | | |

| Title: *Education for Human Rights and* *Democracy/Zimbabwe-history* Number of responses: 2 | Very useful | Useful | A bit useful | Not very useful |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Themes   Non-violence | | 2 | | |
| Tolerance | | 1 | 1 | |
| Democracy | | 2 | | |
| Antiracism | 1 | 1 | | |
| Human rights | 1 | 1 | | |

| Title: *Education for Human Rights and* *Democracy/Zimbabwe-religious studies* Number of responses: 1 | Very useful | Useful | A bit useful | Not very useful |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Themes   Non-violence | 1 | | | |
| Tolerance | | 1 | | |
| Democracy | | | 1 | |
| Antiracism | | | 1 | |
| Human rights | | 1 | | |

7.5.9 In summary, respondents generally perceived the resources to be 'Very useful' and 'Useful' in terms of coverage of UNESCO priorities and themes but more so in their coverage of 'human rights' and 'tolerance' and less so in their coverage of 'anti-racism'.

7.6     Some respondents made additional comments in relation to these resources. Elaborating on her positive perception of the resources, one respondent explained that she valued the way in which the resources provide a sound conceptual analysis of the themes as well as the inclusion of specific activities for teachers and human rights education trainers to develop with the particular groups with which they are working.

7.6.1 Another respondent, while valuing the publications, suggested that their usefulness is limited to more general reference materials, given the country specific nature of education systems, school curricula and the varying extent to which different countries mainstream human rights education into their curricula.  This respondent thought that where human rights education is a separate subject on the school curriculum, then some of the materials could be used as they are.

7.6.2 A different respondent considered it difficult to accurately evaluate the materials using the broad themes found in the questionnaire and thought that on a general level, all of the publications are effective in transmitting the principles, spirit and intentions of UNESCO.  This respondent made the point that there is scope to use these resources flexibly, that most could be used at different levels and stages of education, and that the effectiveness of a resource depends largely on how it is used.  While this could be said of any teaching tool, this respondent was referring in particular to the attitudes and motivation of the teacher/trainer but also that effective human rights education means ensuring that pupils make the jump from knowledge to action competence and that this requires more than good resources.  This respondent also thought that resources should be used as a tool to link into local issues.

7.6.3 In reference to *All Human Beings, Tolerance, Culture of Democracy and the Practice of Citizenship pack*, one respondent thought that more could be done to make them more visually appealing to users.  He saw them as 'drab in appearance and appeal'.

7.7     Estimates of number of copies of resources distributed

Albania         Copies of each of the following distributed (*All Human Beings... Manual for Human Rights Education; Tolerance-the threshold of peace; Culture of Democracy; Practice of Citizenship pack*).

Canada          (Provinces of Newfoundland and Labrador).  Each school received one copy of *All Human Beings... Manual for Human Rights Education; Tolerance-the threshold of peace; Culture of Democracy; Practice of Citizenship pack.*

Croatia         Some copies of of *All Human Beings... Manual for Human Rights Education; Tolerance-the threshold of peace; Culture of Democracy; Peace Pack* have been sent to ASP schools and libraries by the National

Commission for UNESCO but across Croatia distribution is probably quite low.

Finland: 3000 translated copies of *All Human Beings... Manual for Human Rights Education.*

Kosova *The Practice of Citizenship* translated into Albanian.
*The Practice of Citizenship* translated into Bosnian.

Lithuania At least 1000 copies of some resources (*All Human Beings... Manual for Human Rights Education; Tolerance-the threshold of peace; Culture of Democracy)* have been translated into Lithuanian and disseminated during teacher training workshops. Translation costs were covered by grants from UNESCO.

Mozambique 1500 copies of *Education for Human Rights and Democracy in Southern Africa*, 10 copies of *Education for Human Rights and Democracy in Namibia*, 200 copies of *Education for Human Rights and Democracy in Zimbabwe, religious and moral education*.

Namibia 1500 copies of *Education for Human Rights and Democracy in Southern Africa,* 200 copies of *Education for Human Rights and Democracy in Zimbabwe, religious and moral education*.

Senegal: 50 copies of *The Practice of Citizenship.*

Zimbabwe 1500 copies of *Education for Human Rights and Democracy in Southern Africa*, 10 copies of *Education for Human Rights and Democracy in Namibia*.

7.8 Views on whether UNESCO should continue to commission and publish materials on human rights education

7.8.1 All respondents thought that UNESCO should continue to commission and publish materials on human rights education. Reasons given for this include that it is an important part of UNESCO's work, that there is a need for good classroom materials on human rights education and that there are few human rights education materials available to teachers in comparison with conventional subjects.

7.8.2 One respondent suggested that publication activity could, however, be better coordinated not only within the Secretariat, but also with regard to what other regional and international organizations do. In her words,

*There is, for example, still an overlap in what UNESCO and the Council of Europe produce in this field. There still seems to be an unhealthy "ignorance" and a waste of resources.*

However, we suggest that UNESCO does provide classroom materials which are not normally produced by the Council of Europe. Council or Europe materials tend to address policy, strategy and concepts rather than pedagogy.

Another respondent was of the opinion that UNESCO should also support and encourage national publication efforts suggesting that countries prefer resources that suit their local contexts. A further respondent argued that there is also a need for resources that focus on specific problems and strategies that might be useful for solving those problems. The importance of encouraging action research projects, resources that assist trainers/teachers/learners to evaluate their own development and surveys and comparative accounts of existing practices were also suggested.

7.9 The question on what type of human rights education materials are most needed yielded a wide range of responses. Some focused on target audience with two respondents suggesting a particular need for more resources suitable for use with adolescents, another suggesting a need for teacher training material with a fourth suggesting a need for more training materials for lay people. Some responses focused in general terms on the need for human rights education resources that can be used directly in the classroom, resources that can easily be linked in to the school curriculum and resources that relate to specific and current issues. Youth and human rights, the media and human rights and human rights education in multicultural contexts were three specific areas identified by respondents in relation to the latter. One person suggested that some resources need to place greater emphasis on the links between 'international standards, national priorities and local possibilities'. Other respondents focused on the medium of instruction suggesting greater use of the internet and the use of the media to reach a wider audience.

7.9.1 The two excerpts below provide an example of the variation of responses to this question with the second one making the point that what is most needed is likely to vary depending on the particular country and educational context in question.

*Any material will be helpful provided it is conceptually sound, relevant to current human rights issues and includes practical activities that can be developed in schools and communities.*

*What is most needed depends on the country. In [this country], what is most needed is HRE material that promotes tolerance, conflict resolution, dialogue and equality, such as 'The Practice of Citizenship'.*

7.10 Several additional comments on UNESCO's HRE publications or future policy were made.

7.10.1 One respondent suggested the need for closer links between what is done in the Education Sector and the Social and Human Sciences Sector of UNESCO suggesting in particular that they should have the same publication strategies. This respondent also argued for greater co-operation with other relevant organisations in

relation to publications.  Another respondent was of the opinion that promotion of civic action projects in schools could be given a higher priority and that more information is needed on how such projects might be funded.

7.10.2 Several respondents thought that materials from UNESCO should be more widely disseminated with one person arguing that more direct dissemination to schools, teachers and educational researchers would be helpful with another suggesting that information on publications has not been well disseminated with schools and other organisations sometimes being unaware of what is available.

7.10.3 Linked to this, a number of respondents identified several barriers to wider dissemination and use.  The first of these is to do with cost with one person observing that,

*UNESCO is able to distribute only a limited number of documents/publications for further distribution and use in the Member States and many countries cannot afford to buy additional copies.*

7.10.4 This issue is accentuated when resources need to be translated into local languages or as one respondent put it,

*Although many users are fluent in English, they want the material in national languages and translation is expensive.*

7.10.5 Several respondents suggested that assistance for translation into local languages is important while another made the point that some materials are considered too general to warrant the cost of extensive translation.  The issue of translation is one that has been recognized by UNESCO whose advisory committee recommended that:

*a special effort be made to translate educational material produced by UNESCO into national languages.*

7.10.6 Additional training on the use of materials was another issue identified as was the importance of monitoring and evaluating the use made of various resources and research on the strengths, limitations and effectiveness of the resources.

## 8. Perspectives of staff at UNESCO headquarters

8.1 The staff interviews were predominantly from the Education Sector. Interviews were also held with staff from the Social Sciences Sector and with UNESCO publishing.

8.2 Education Sector Staff stressed that the contribution of HRE materials to UNESCO's mission of developing universal principles and norms and promoting pluralism. In particular staff perceive that not all Member States are equally committed to HRE.

8.3 Social Sciences staff work within a framework of human rights as an academic discipline. Some of their materials provide accessible introductions to human rights issues and are included in packs produced within the Education Sector.

8.4 Social Sciences staff consider that the development of a culture of human rights requires information and education from an early age. The production of HRE materials by the Education Sector complements their work.

8.5 UNESCO publications section was able to provide details of sales of HRE materials and of permissions to translate the materials. However, staff in the Education Sector do not necessarily maintain contact with Member States requesting translations (e.g. India, Turkey, Japan).

8.6 Staffing at UNESCO Headquarters provides very limited capacity to actively disseminate HRE materials. There is no mechanism to follow up the use of the materials once they have been produced or to receive systematic feed-back on their impact.

8.7 One significant recent HRE initiative has been the joint production, funded by Education International, of a CD Rom of HRE resources and materials. The project was advised by a focus group drawn from a range of member states. The group identified the need for basic texts and teacher friendly materials. However, the funding included production costs but no element for dissemination. The project develops an innovative use of ICT, but it is unlikely to have an impact at grassroots level in Member States until a systematic dissemination strategy in partnership with Member States is introduced.

8.8 Officers were usually well aware of the strategic guidance provided by the General Conference and the Medium Term Strategy. However, evidence from staff suggested that they would benefit from clear guidance and support in operationalising the strategy.

8.9 Several officers emphasised the difference that small sums of money can make. Sometimes requests for translation into national languages have to be turned down because of lack of funds. The setting up of a small voluntary fund to help the

translation and dissemination of HRE material would be welcomed. Dissemination is apparently inhibited by lack of clerical support for mass mailings.

**9. Personal reflections by the evaluation team**

9.1 The evaluation process provided the opportunity to examine in detail materials produced by UNESCO to support human rights education within formal education, particularly schools.

9.2 We are aware of further exemplary materials, produced by the Social and Human Sciences Sector, promoting human rights education in universities and making normative instruments widely available. These were not the subject of our scrutiny.

9.3 The relationship of education and social sciences staff at headquarters to those in Member States working to promote the UNESCO agenda appears often to be reactive rather than pro-active.

9.4 We ourselves experienced the frustration of difficulty of communication with partners. Of the 30 contacts we were given, all known to be users of the materials, only half responded in any way and only a third were able to provide us with information. We suspect that the fact that financial constraints which obliged us to communicate solely in English significantly reduced our response rate.

9.5 Whilst we were working to a very tight time-scale, those responsible for implementing the current Medium-term Strategy have the opportunity to address and resolve issues of communication. They can also prioritise their actions and, in particular develop a dissemination strategy for the materials. Without this the impact of the materials remains limited.

9.6 We see the provision of HRE materials as being of considerable importance, given that HRE is not yet on the curricula or all Member States.

9.7 We observe a need for a systematic dissemination strategy which addresses the varied needs of States and which prioritises according to need..

9.8 We believe UNESCO urgently needs to develop materials that address racism. Our study reveals that this issue is currently neglected.

9.9 Although materials currently address gender issues, users indicated that they would appreciate further materials which examine gender equity in a more effective manner.

9.10 We would argue that materials also need to support teachers in developing a culture and climate of human rights in schools and enable schools to practise rights.

9.11 Materials currently neglect issues related to terrorism. It might be useful to address such concerns by focusing on the positive need for safety and security.

9.12 A lot of attention has been given to the issue of tolerance. We suggest that future materials review the adequacy of this concept and supplement it with a concern for equity and justice in contexts of diversity.

**10 . Conclusions and recommendations**

10.1    The sample of UNESCO HRE publications analysed is generally of a high quality and fit for purpose.

10.2    The publications contribute to UNESCO's mission and Medium Term Strategy in the following ways:

- dissemination of normative values
- provision of an authoritative model, adaptable for local use
- coverage of a wide range of UNESCO themes

10.3    There are every few materials which may be considered to address the key themes of terrorism and anti-racism.  Even when such themes are covered, users judge this coverage to be less useful than in other areas.

10.4    The degree to which the various resources had been effectively disseminated varied considerably.

10.4.1  There needs to be greater co-ordination within UNESCO between those responsible for commissioning publications and those responsible for publication processes, in order for dissemination strategies to be more fully developed and implemented.

10.4.2  Dissemination must be an integral part of the process of materials development not an afterthought.  The *Peace Package* (developed by ASPnet schools) and disseminated through ASPnet is exemplary in this respect.

10.5    Further attention needs to be given to translation strategies, including the funding of translation for countries experiencing economic difficulties.

10.6    UNESCO lacks information about the dissemination of co-published resources and their impact.

10.6.1  Criteria for co-publication and for badging of materials need to be explicit and transparent, so that both users and officers can be assured that the materials reflect UNESCO's mission.

10.7    Co-published regionally produced materials appear well-suited to their audiences and highly valued by those users who responded to our enquiries.

10.8    The data collected from officers suggests that there is a lack of an overall strategy for the production of HRE materials.

**Recommendations for future HRE publications**

i        UNESCO continues to commission, publish and disseminate HRE materials.

ii      UNESCO develops a strategy for the publication and dissemination of HRE materials, taking into consideration the needs for a wide range of countries to have access to materials based on normative standards.

iii     UNESCO gives particular consideration, within this publication strategy to regions and countries where there is a shortage of educational resources.

iv     UNESCO ensures that those commissioning and producing HRE materials give emphasis to areas currently neglected, namely issues of anti-racism, gender and terrorism.

v        UNESCO ensures that dissemination is an integral part of any publication project.

vi      UNESCO works more closely with users from a full range of regions and countries to monitor and evaluate use of materials (e.g. use focus groups in production and dissemination)

vii    UNESCO builds in systematic review and external evaluation of its future HRE publication projects.

viii   UNESCO reviews its funding mechanisms for translation of HRE materials for countries experiencing economic difficulty. For instance, a small voluntary fund to help the translation and dissemination of HRE material could be set up.

ix     UNESCO develops systems for the monitoring of usage of translated and co-published work (e.g. contractual obligation to provide distribution information when license issued).

x        Future commissioning processes incorporate the use of the analytical grid for this evaluation (see Appendix 1).

**Appendix 1 Analytical Grid**

| Theme | Very full coverage | Some coverage | Mentioned | Not mentioned |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Non-violent conflict resolution | | | | |
| Tolerance | | | | |
| Democracy | | | | |
| Antiracism | | | | |
| Gender Equality | | | | |
| Human rights | | | | |
| Religious intolerance | | | | |
| Sustainable development | | | | |
| Terrorism | | | | |
| UNESCO and UN | | | | |
| Human rights texts e.g. UDHR, UNCRC | | | | |
| International dimension | | | | |
| Cultural diversity | | | | |

This grid was used as an evaluation tool by the team engaged in this project. It is also recommended that those commissioning and preparing future materials refer to this resource. First, the proposed resource might emphasise those aspects of the UNESCO mission which have been largely overlooked to date (for example, terrorism, anti-racism). Secondly, the writing team might use the grid to consider the degree to which their draft materials meet UNESCO criteria.

**Appendix 2 List of Interviewees at UNESCO HQ**

**Formal interviews were held with:**

Georgina Almeida, Editorial and Rights Division, UNESCO Publishing

Sibanda Backson, Senior Evaluation Specialist, Internal Oversight Service

Jill Britland, Information and Documentation Services (Multimedia development), Education Sector

Bernard Combes, Section for Early Childhood and Family Education, Education Sector

Vincent Defourny, Evaluation Specialist, Internal Oversight Service

R. Halperin, Chief of Section for Secondary and Teacher Education, Education Sector

Louise Haxthausen, Programme Specialist, Division of Human Rights, Peace, Democracy and Tolerance, Social Sciences Sector

Elizabeth Khawajkie, International Co-ordinator, Associated Schools Network (ASPNet), Education Sector

Kishore Singh, Policy Division, Education Sector

Patricia Toigo, Information and Documentation Services, Education Sector

Vladimir Volodine, Head of Human Rights and Development Unit, Division of Human Rights, Peace, Democracy and Tolerance, Social Sciences Sector

Briefing meetings were held with:
Edouard Matoko, Chief of Section of Education for Universal Values

Paulo Fontani, Section of Education for Universal Values

Miriam Karela, Section of Education for Universal Values

David Stanton, Ambassador and Permanent Delegate of UK to UNESCO

Christine Apkinson, Deputy Permanent Delegate of UK to UNESCO

John Daniel, ADG, Education

**Appendix 3**

**List of countries, institutions and persons responding to HRE user survey by region:**

**Africa**

| | |
|---|---|
| Kenya: | Standing Committee on Human Rights, Nairobi: Michael Ngabirano |
| Senegal: | Ministry of Education (INEADE), Dakar: Boubacar Tall |
| Zimbabwe: | UNESCO, Sub-regional Adviser, Education for Human Rights and Democracy, Melania Rukanda |

**Europe**

| | |
|---|---|
| Albania: | UNESCO HRE project, Project Manager: Zhuljeta Harasani |
| Croatia: | UNESCO HRE project, former Project Co-ordinator: Vedrana Spajic-Vrkas |
| Finland: | Ministry of Education, Finnish National Commission for UNESCO, Zabrina Holmstrom |
| Kosova: | Kosova Centre for Human Rights, Dr Neshad Asllani |
| Lithuania: | Regional Centre for Civic Education, Vilnius: Dr Irena Zaleskiene |

**Americas**

| | |
|---|---|
| Canada: | British Columbia Ministry of Education, Vancouver: Sharon Jeroski Newfoundland and Labrador Department of Education: Dr Glenn Loveless/Elmo Taylor |
| Costa Rica: | Inter-American Institute of Human Rights, Pedagogical Unit Co-ordinator: Anna Maria Rodino |

Additionally, responses were sought form: Namibia, South Africa, Tunisia, Australia, Bangladesh, Indonesia, Belgium, Italy, Netherlands, Portugal, El Salvador, Jamaica and Uruguay.